

## Report to Planning Committee

**Application Number:** 2022/0835

**Appeal Ref:** APP/N3020/W/23/3317847

**Site Address:** 135 Main Street, Calverton, Nottinghamshire, NG14 6FE

**Application description:** Full planning application for the erection of two single storey dwellings with private access driveway and the conversion of the former smithy to a separate, stand-alone studio workshop falling within planning use class E (commercial, service and business use)

**Case Officer:** Claire Turton

### Reason for Refusal

The planning application was refused permission on the 16<sup>th</sup> January 2023 for the reason outlined below:

*“The proposed scheme would completely remove the open green space character of the plot and cause harm to the significance of the conservation area and the setting of the listed building. The introduction not only of two dwellings but also the metalled access driveway resulting in vehicle parking would change the character and appearance of the plot from semi-rural in nature to urban and block important views from Main Street south. The development would result in the erosion of the open space and its relationship with the lands to the rear of buildings closer to Main Street and the special historic character of the conservation area.*

*The application fails to preserve the character and appearance of the Calverton Conservation Area and therefore does not comply with LPD26 and 28 for the reasons stated. The application does not preserve the setting of the listed building and will by its erosion of the garden space result in harm to the setting of 135 Main Street which derives significance from its surroundings as does the old smithy. The application therefore does not comply with LPD 27 or LPD 31 of the GBC Local Plan and Policy BE5 of the Calverton Neighbourhood Plan.*

*For the reasons given, the application is contrary to the above stated policies where the less than substantial harm that would occur is not outweighed by identified public benefits.”*

### Heritage Background

By way of a background on the heritage assets, the Calverton Conservation Area Appraisal (CAA) provides important detail on this specific site stating;-

*“From Main Street at the junction of Woods Lane, one is able to look across the garden of 135 and through to the old orchard and countryside beyond, with the gable end of 133 Main Street visible at the edge of sight. This, as with the views of the playing field, is one of the few that serve to provide a fitting rural*

*setting to the historic buildings in this part of the Conservation Area uncompromised by modern infill” (paragraph 4.15). Paragraph 3.12 also notes that the position of the house with its gable facing the road and backing onto a historic trackway to make the best use of the land is recognised as a characteristic feature of the historic settlement. Furthermore, the CAA identifies the land within the plot to the rear of the house as being an important area of open space (Map 4) and identifies key views and vistas across the plot (Map 5).*

The Planning Inspector (PI) agreed with the findings of the CAA stating;-

*“The historic properties set in long, narrow plots along Main Street, the siting of the buildings towards the plot frontages and open land to the rear all noticeably contribute to the historic rural character of the area as well as creating a feeling of openness. The clustering of these linear plots around the appeal site provides a clear reminder of the settlements historic form ... There is no doubt that the view from Main Street of No. 135 set within its linear plot makes a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the CA, and from what I have read and seen on site it plays a major role in defining the area’s historic significance. Its key features are the position of the dwelling close to the road frontage, backing on to the historic track, its visual relationship with the former smithy and the views through to the open space behind and the vegetation beyond.”*

The PI identified the importance of the listed dwelling as follows;-

*“I consider that the special interest/significance of the listed building is largely derived from its age, historic fabric, form, its architectural features and function. Its long linear plot originally leading out to the countryside, its remnant historic orchard to the rear and its connection with the former smithy all form part of the listed building’s special interest/significance. Insofar as it relates to the appeal site, the listed building is mainly experienced from Main Street and from the interconnected views both within and across the appeal site. These are the surroundings in which the listed building is experienced and appreciated, and these views directly contribute to its special interest/significance. Any development within this plot therefore has the potential to impact on the contribution that the setting makes to its significance.”*

The PI also agreed with the Council that the former smithy outbuilding is a non-designated heritage asset (NDHA).

### PI Assessment

The PI assessed that;-

*“The siting of the two dwellings, the construction of the driveway and the provision of car parking would have a significant impact on the character and appearance of the plot. To the rear of the existing buildings, the green, open plot and its remnant orchard would be replaced with a substantial area of buildings and hard surfacing. Although the proposed dwellings would only be single storey, their proposed siting across much of the width of the plot would largely sever the significant views along the length of the plot through to the mature trees to the south; including the large sycamore tree on the*

*site which is proposed to be retained. Furthermore, the rising ground levels to the rear of the existing dwelling would further increase their visible presence within the site.*

*The historic plot which is so clearly identified within the Council's CAA as making a significant contribution to the area's historic settlement form would be irreversibly altered and its rural, open character would be replaced by a built development making it noticeably more urban. It would harm not just the historic character of this plot but also erode the contribution that this cluster of traditional plots makes to the wider character and appearance of the area. Although the proposed buildings would be to the rear of No.135 and the former smithy, views of the new buildings would be clearly seen from Main Street, made more noticeable by the enlarged site access and new drive.*

*The setting of the listed building would also therefore be irreversibly harmed. The position of the proposed dwellings would deprive the building of its open rural setting within its plot and erode its historic functional connection with the land. Furthermore, the listed building would be left with just a parking area alongside Main Street and a small front garden, and the enlarged access and drive and parking adjacent to the former smithy would further erode the historic character of the plot as well as impact the close visual connection with the former smithy*

...

*Although the proposal would sensitively repair and re-use the former smithy, the intimate relationship between it and the listed building and its rural, open backdrop would be altered by the combined effects of the proposed development, including the drive which would run close to its frontage. The proposed development would therefore have a harmful impact on the contribution that the setting makes to its significance.*

...

The PI concluded that the proposal would have a harmful impact on the character and appearance of the CA and on the contribution that the setting makes to the special interest/significance of the listed building and that the public benefits would be of insufficient weight to be given to the harm of the designated heritage assets.

As a result, the appeal has been dismissed.

**Recommendation:** To note the information.